

# **Fractious Problem-Solving Skills (FPSS)**

#### Author(s)

Roberta M. Berry

#### Description

Worksheet describes Five Characteristics of Fractious Problems and Six Skills for Addressing the Characteristics of Fractious Problems To Advance Understanding and Potential Resolutions. Includes a grading rubric and grade sheets.

#### Body

# A. Five Characteristics of Fractious Problems

#### (1) Novel

- These problems are *generated by rapid advances* in science and technology.
- We have not encountered them before.
- We have not arrived at a broadly shared social understanding of them.
- We have not arrived at stable policy resolutions for them.

#### (2) Complex

• These problems are *scientifically complex* because *they concern life*.

- They are *psychologically complex* because they implicate our *self-understanding* (as moral agents, as agents with free will, as ensouled persons, etc.)
- They are socially complex because they implicate our understanding of ourselves as social beings (members of families, ethnicities, religions, disability/difference groups, species, etc.)

# (3) Ethically Fraught

- These problems evoke significant ethical concerns across diverse and sometimes conflicting religious & secular worldviews.
- They concern the most sensitive and profound of human experiences (procreation and parenting; beginning and end of life; death and dying; illness, disability, and suffering; privacy and choice; survival of individuals and of social groups-families, ethnicities, religions, disability/difference groups, species, etc.)

## (4) Public

- These problems *resist confinement to the purely private realm* of individual choice.
- The dividing line between their *private and public dimensions will be controversial and contested.*
- The dimensions that are contested are those that are ethically fraught—we strive to protect or advance many, often conflicting values associated with shared human experiences of procreation, parenting, etc.

### (5) Divisive

- The above 4 characteristics render these problems socially divisive.
- We will struggle to understand and address their novelty.
- We struggle with the multiple levels of complexity.
- Our struggle is compounded by their ethically fraught nature—these things really matter to almost all of us across our diverse and sometimes conflicting worldviews.
- Our struggle is compounded by the contested dividing line between private and public.

# B. Six Skills for Addressing the Characteristics of Fractious Problems To Advance Understanding and Potential Resolutions

## (1) Perspectives

Consider *multiple and diverse perspectives*—disciplinary, worldview, life experience—to advance understanding of and potential resolutions addressing:

- novelty (multiple and diverse efforts to understand and address)
- complexity (scientific, psychological, social)
- ethically fraught nature (across worldviews, concerning sensitive and profound)
- *public nature* (contested dividing lines between public and private dimensions)
- divisiveness (understand and address incorporating diverse perspectives)

## (2) Precedent

Consider *historical analogies to similar or related problems*, including past and current policy resolutions and their rationales, to advance understanding of and potential resolutions addressing:

- novelty (we have encountered, understood, and resolved similar or related)
- complexity (scientific, psychological, social understood and addressed previously)
- ethically fraught nature (we have addressed ethical concerns previously)
- *public nature* (we have defined the public and private dimensions previously)
- *divisiveness* (we have achieved principled consensus resolutions previously)

# (3) Prediction

Consider the *predicted future impacts of possible understandings and policy resolutions on all stakeholders*, to advance understanding of and potential resolutions addressing:

- novelty (what are the predicted impacts of possible policy resolutions)
- complexity (what are the scientific, psychological, social dimensions of these)
- ethically fraught nature (what are the ethical implications across worldviews)
- *public nature* (what are the implications for the line between public and private)
- divisiveness (what are the implications for the divisiveness of the problem)

### (4) Possibilities

Employ imagination and flexibility to expand the range of possible understandings and policy resolutions, by brainstorming, reflection, role-playing, reference to literature, film, or other devices, to advance understanding of and potential resolutions addressing:

- novelty (what are the predicted impacts of possible policy resolutions)
- *complexity* (what are the scientific, psychological, social dimensions of these)
- ethically fraught nature (what are the ethical implications across worldviews)
- public nature (what are the implications for the line between public and private)
- divisiveness (what are the implications for the divisiveness of the problem)

## (5) Persistence

Consider social understanding and policy resolutions as part of a dynamic, incremental, iterative, ongoing process requiring persistence in response to changed conditions and to feedback from previous choices, to advance understanding of and potential resolutions addressing:

- novelty (some novel dimensions may be addressed later with more understanding)
- complexity (more dimensions may emerge and be addressed later)
- ethically fraught nature (worldviews may shift with impacts & understanding)
- public nature (the line between public and private may also shift)
- divisiveness (divisiveness may change as other characteristics change)

# (6) Principles

Strive to identify limited, non-comprehensive consensus principles that capture shared understanding and policy resolutions adequate to a persistent process, to advance understanding of and potential resolutions addressing:

- *novelty* (principles for coping with novelty and uncertainty)
- complexity (principles for coping with complexity)
- ethically fraught nature (principles that are shared across worldviews)
- *public nature* (principles for defining the line between public and private)
- *divisiveness* (principles for addressing divisiveness)

# C. Grading Rubric for Assessing Fractious Problem Skills

- Excellent application of skill (A grade)
- Proficient application of skill (B grade)
- Fair application of skill (C grade)
- Poor evidence of application of skill (D grade)

#### Notes

This work is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 3.0 Unported License. To view a copy of this license, visit <u>http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/3.0/</u> or send a letter to Creative Commons, 444 Castro Street, Suite 900, Mountain View, California, 94041, USA.

Contact author: Roberta M. Berry <robertaberry@gatech.edu>

#### Rights

Use of Materials on the OEC

#### **Resource Type**

Instructor Materials

#### Topics

Ethical Decision-Making Pedagogical Approaches

#### Discipline(s)

Engineering Teaching Ethics in STEM